



ATIC Board Agenda for Wednesday, March 13, 2024

1. Administrative

- 1.1. Self-Introductions
- 1.2. Modifications to and Acceptance of Agenda Draft
- 1.3. Acceptance of Minutes from February 14, 2024, Board Meeting
- 1.4. Treasurer's Report (Ron Schott)
- 1.5. ATIC Board Membership Considerations
 - 1.5.1. ATIC Broadband Providers Working Group Meeting & Next Steps
 - 1.5.2. ATIC Board Elections Follow Up
- 1.6. Review of Outstanding Action Items as Documented in February 14, 2024, Minutes

2. Informational Presentations

2.1. None Scheduled

3. Activity Reports

- 3.1. Arizona Broadband Office Report (Sandip Bhowmick)
 - 3.1.1. Broadband Grants, Rural Community Outreach & Projects
 - 3.1.2. Digital Equity Initiatives & Opportunities
 - 3.1.3. ACA Broadband Strategy & ATIC Role/Support
- 3.2. Arizona Broadband Stakeholder Network (Steve Peters)
 - 3.2.1. AZBSN Digital Access Task Force Updates
 - 3.2.2. AZBSN Leadership Group, Committees & Initiatives
 - 3.2.3. Outreach Activities with Newsletters & Webinars
- 3.3. Technology in Education/eLearning
 - 3.3.1. Arizona Technology in Education Association (AzTEA) (Nan Williams)
 - 3.3.2. Greater Arizona Educational Leadership (GAZEL) (Steve Peters)
 - 3.3.3. Sun Corridor Network (SCN) (Laura Etter)
- 3.4. Arizona State Library (Holly Henley, Mala Muralidharan)
- 3.5. Telehealth (Michael Holcomb)
- 3.6. Government Affairs
 - 3.6.1. Arizona Broadband Policy Update (John Kelly, Mark Goldstein)
 - 3.6.2. Federal Broadband Policy Update (Nicole Umayam/NTIA, Mark Goldstein)

4. Information and Action Plans

- 4.1. ATIC Website & Teleconferencing (All)
 - 4.1.1. AZBSN Communications & Newsletter
- 4.2. ATIC Mailing List & CRM (All)
- 4.3. New Business and Motion Considerations (All)
- 5. Events Attended and Upcoming Meetings
- 6. Announcements
- 7. Adjourn





ATIC Board Meeting Minutes

March 13, 2024

Attendees:

ATIC Board Members:

Mark Goldstein, Henry Goldberg, Oris Friesen, Ron Schott, Corey Christians, Jerry Crow, Holly Henley, Erin Lorandos proxy for Sandip Bhowmick, Andy Phelan.

ATIC Associates & Guests:

Steve Peters (Coordinator, Arizona Broadband Stakeholder Network Digital Access Task Force), Caroline Klebacha (Archaeological Compliance Specialist, Arizona State Historic Preservation Office), Maggie Farry (Strategic Initiatives Director for Broadband and Digital Equity, Governor Hobbs Office), Dan Coxworth (Director of Development Services, Cochise County), Brian Daly (Assistant Vice President for Wireless Broadband Technology and Standards, AT&T), Shereka Jackson (Founder and CEO, Future Stars Inc.), Christopher Becenti (Federal Program Officer, NTIA Tribal Broadband Connectivity Group), Paul Kealey (Associate Director, Information Assurance and Security Education Center at the University of Arizona), John Haass (Professor of Cyber Intelligence and Security, Embry-Riddle Aeronautical University, and Executive Coach, Center for the Future in Arizona)

Quorum Met with 9 ATIC Board Members Present (Quorum = 9)

A replay of the meeting is available at https://youtu.be/xy1yg4uv6eM.

Many thanks to Nan Williams and the Arizona Technology in Education Association (AzTEA, http://aztea.org/) for the use of their Zoom Video account for video conferencing and dial-in capabilities and to the Arizona State Library for providing additional support.

The next ATIC Board Meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, April 10, 2024, virtually. The schedule of ATIC Board Meetings for the balance of 2024 can be found towards the end of these minutes.



1. Administrative

1.1. Self-Introductions

See the list of attendees above.

1.2. Modifications to and Acceptance of Agenda Draft

MOTION: To accept the Agenda

MOVE: Henry Goldberg SECOND: Jerry Crow Passed Unanimously

1.3. Acceptance of Minutes from February 14, 2024, Board Meeting

Oris Friesen writes the draft minutes, after which they are reviewed carefully by Henry Goldberg, and Mark Goldstein does a final edit of the draft minutes before issuing them to the Board as a draft for review, comment, and approval.

MOTION: To accept the Minutes

Mark Goldstein thanked Kirk Busch for updating our logo which appears at the top of the minutes. Mark noted that he had inadvertently deleted the five-years' worth of historical minutes from the website. The more recent ones will be replaced soon.

MOVE: Corey Christians SECOND: Mark Goldstein Passed Unanimously

1.4. Treasurer's Report

Ron Schott, Treasurer, circulated via email the Desert Financial Credit Union statement with account and transaction details for Board reference, which are included at the back of these Minutes. Ron reported that current funds on hand total \$8008.35. All major bills have been paid including the monthly Century Link bill. Mark still has some outstanding bills of a few hundred dollars from the past six months for which he needs to be reimbursed.

At the October Board meeting John Kelly had commented that ATIC might wish to consider dropping the Directors & Officers insurance since it may not be necessary for our type of organization. John stated he spoke to an insurance broker about this, and this may be an expense ATIC does need to have. John





said there seems to be no risk-associated tasks that ATIC is engaged in, such as consulting, operational, or financial exposure. Henry Goldberg stated he does not feel comfortable dropping this insurance since the directors/officers are doing this work pro-bono and have no protection against any possible lawsuits, and some officers such as Mark and Henry are doing or may do consulting work in areas that relate to ATIC activities. Mark pointed out that the consulting he does is not for ATIC, and he carries his own professional liability insurance for his consulting firm. Kirk said that if we decide to do some tasks for ACA that may change our risk status so we should probably keep it for now. Mark also noted that we may be involved in some new state broadband and digital equity projects. John explained that the insurance does not protect us against frivolous lawsuits other than if, as officers, we act in ways that are incompatible with our fiduciary responsibilities, and his firm carries liability insurance protection against lawsuits rather than Directors & Officers Insurance. He suggested that we talk to our broker about this. Mark suggested that we take a wait-and-see position, especially since the insurance is paid up through the middle of 2024 and take no action at this time. ATIC continues to consider making a decision on this.

Steve Peters reported that there are no funds remaining in the Arizona Broadband Stakeholder Network account. The most recent sponsors were Karen Ziegler Consulting Services and Triad Wireless. Steve has launched a sponsorship drive to raise further funding (https://www.arizonatele.org/funding-request-2020.html) and needs to become more active in securing some sponsorship renewals and new sponsorships. He is speaking with Sandip Bhowmick (State Broadband Office Director) and others about obtaining funding.

Mark has noted at previous meetings that the ATIC bank balance has been drifting down, but with remote ATIC Board meetings we no longer have to pay for lunches for attendees. Mark has commented in the past that ATIC needs to pursue its own funding, which would include sponsorships. ATIC needs to initiate a financial campaign for sponsors and other sources of funding to support and undertake new projects. Mark noted that in the past ATIC has been paid to host rural broadband workshops and has pursued various projects when it had more funds.

1.5. ATIC Board Membership Considerations

Mark Goldstein reported that he e-mailed and removed Bill Bolin and Matt Dostal from the Board due to their inactivity over the past several years and invited them to still participate if they are interested. This brings our Board membership down to 27. Mike Keeling past ATIC Lobbyist, notified the Officers that he is now retired and so has resigned from the Board. Our bylaws allow for 30 Board Members plus 5 officers, and so still have the capacity up to 8 new Board members.





Mark is still waiting to hear from Brent Nelson of the Navajo Nation Department of Diné Education and from Joy Whiting, the Apache County Superintendent of Schools, about joining the ATIC Board. Mark has also asked Ian Hathcock of CellularOne about contacting Sonia Nez, the Navajo Nation Broadband Manager to join the Board, and is waiting to hear from Ian. Mark will reach out to Brent Nelson, Joy Whiting, and Ian Hathcock again. Mark plans to talk to Jeff Mirasola of Lumen Technologies about staying on the Board or providing a replacement. Steve commented that he had recently spoken to Mirasola and he did not sound enthusiastic about participating in ATIC or AZBSN.

Two people, who have attended AZBSN meetings, have contacted Mark recently about interest in joining the ATIC Board: Tamara Rosenberg of Resound Networks (https://resoundnetworks.com/), who attended last month, and Mignonne Hollis of the Arizona Regional Economic Development Foundation (AREDF, https://www.aredf.org/) located in Sierra Vista. Mark has encouraged them to engage with ATIC and attend future ATIC Board meetings. They remain interested. He also spoke with Shaun Story of Calix Networks, who is potentially interested in becoming a sponsor of ATIC and/or AZBSN. Mark noted that we are looking for tribal representation on the ATIC Board such as Sonia Nez mentioned above and had asked EJ John of the ASU American Indian Policy Institute about joining but he declined because of lack of time. Regarding tribal representation, Shereka Jackson mentioned a Native American as a possibility, whose coordinates are RJ Huskey, of Hozho Cybersecurity (www.gohozho.com, rj@gohozho.com, 602-999-9369). Last month we elected Dario Solis, Business Engagement Manager for the ASU Fulton Schools of Engineering, to the Board.

We will hold annual elections for ATIC officers next month at our April 10th Board meeting – see Section 1.5.2.

1.5.1. ATIC Broadband Provider Working Group Meeting and Next Steps

Mark had some recent discussions with Sandip Bhowmick, State Broadband Director at ACA, but there is nothing new to report. As reported previously, an outcome of the January 2022 ATIC Board meeting was to create an ATIC Broadband Provider Working Group whose function would be to provide a platform for providers to share information, meet & network, and engage on policy issues since there is no telecom service provider trade association in Arizona. The goal of this working group is to focus on addressing common issues and opportunities for the broadband service providers in Arizona. The group was launched on April 6, 2022, with a hybrid gathering hosted at Big Data Southwest's DataCenter & SmartCity IoT Infrastructure Summit





Mark had started a Slack channel populated with a list of about 160 provider representatives across about 80 companies from his spreadsheet. Mark circulated this spreadsheet to Sandip Bhowmick and Nicole Umayam for their reference and any additions/changes.

Mark convened a second meeting of the ATIC Broadband Provider Working Group, as a part of the Big Data Southwest's DataCenter & SmartCity IoT Infrastructure Summit (#USDC23, https://www.bigdatasw.org/) on January 26, 2023, at the Desert Willow Conference Center in Phoenix. He has activated the Slack channel and about fifteen people have joined it, but it is not very active yet.

At a previous ATIC board meeting Mark suggested we might create parallel Slack channels for two working groups with the Broadband Providers Working Group focusing on concerns of the communications providers, as initially planned. The second group would deal with topics and issues of economic development that include localized concerns as well as those that transcend county boundaries.

Mark noted that the Slack Channel has not taken off as he had hoped and is open to taking comments on this and/or suggestions for alternate broadband provider engagement strategies/initiatives.

1.5.2. ATIC Board Elections Follow Up

Mark reported that we will hold our annual election of ATIC Executive Committee Officers at the April 10, 2024, Board Meeting. The officer positions are: Chair, Vice Chair, Secretary, Treasurer, and Lobbyist. Mark asked attendees of this meeting to contact him if they have interest in becoming an ATIC officer.

1.6. Review of Outstanding Action Items as Documented in February 14, 2024, Minutes

Nothing to report

2. Informational Presentations

2.1. None were scheduled.





3. Activity Reports

3.1. Arizona Broadband Office Report (Sandip Bhowmick)

Sandip Bhowmick, State Broadband Director at the Arizona Commerce Authority (ACA) State Broadband Office, was unable to be present, so Erin Lorandos, ACA Digital Equity Program Manager, provided an update on key recent activities of the State Broadband Office.

Erin gave a brief report on the status of the process to challenge the accuracy of the served, underserved and unserved locations on the State Broadband Office broadband map. The challenge process will start on March 14 and continue for two months. This follows the explanatory webinars that have been held for local governments, ISPs and tribal governments, as well as a final explanatory webinar on March 14th for non-profit organizations. The Arizona BEAD Challenge Process is detailed at

https://www.azcommerce.com/broadband/arizona-broadband-equity-access-deployment-program/the-challenge-process/ and the Arizona Challenge Process Portal is now open at

https://az.broadbandnavigator.com/map?zoom=7¢er=-

12460707%2C4061995 with challenge submissions due by May 14, 2024. The ISP rebuttal window is open for 15 days following each challenge. The Arizona Broadband office is also hosting open office hours on Tuesday afternoons for the challenge process one-off meetings with permissible challengers and members of the public to answer questions on the BEAD Challenge Process.

The State Digital Equity Plan draft has been submitted to NTIA and is still in their curing phase to provide feedback. ACA appreciates the public comments received previously on the Digital Equity Plan draft including from the AZBSN Study Session in January. The State Broadband Office expects to submit the final Digital Equity Plan to NTIA by the end of March, which will incorporate changes based on NTIA feedback. After that, the State Broadband Office will proceed to the Digital Equity Capacity Grants phase, and Erin will provide more information on that once the corresponding NOFO requirements are received.

The ACA has opened RFQ #2024-46: Broadband and Digital Equity Consulting and Management Services to develop a list of qualified vendors to provide advisory support with the implementation of their BEAD and Digital Equity Programs. Questions are due by March 14, 2024, and applications by April 1, 2024. You may request copies of the RFQ at https://www.azcommerce.com/about-us/public-notices/.

Maggie Farry, Governor Hobbs' Strategic Initiative Director for Broadband and Digital Equity, spoke about the Arizona engagement tour on broadband and



digital equity, which is starting in northern Arizona and will be followed by other regions of the state. Details on times and locations are available on the website at https://www.azcommerce.com/broadband/connecting-arizona-engagement-tour/.

Maggie also reported on the Governor's Interagency and Community Broadband Advisory Council, consisting of about 30 members, representing industries, community organizations, local government, and state government, which meets quarterly. The Council has also had six working groups, which met monthly, charged with engaging stakeholders around the state on broadband and digital inclusion issues and initiatives including: 1) Infrastructure and Permitting; 2) Mapping; 3) Digital Inclusion; 4) Affordability; 5) Workforce; and 6) Outreach. These have now been consolidated into three working groups: 1) infrastructure, permitting and mapping, 2) digital inclusion and 3) workforce that are meeting monthly. A fourth working group will be piloted in April to focus on broadband and digital equity challenges faced by tribal communities. If you are interested in participating (or in getting on the distribution list for recordings of the meetings) in any of the working groups, contact Maggie Farry, at mfarry@az.gov or (602) 290-5726.

3.1.1. Broadband Grants, Rural Community Outreach & Projects

The content for this section is included above in Section 3.1.

3.1.2. Digital Equity Initiatives & Opportunities

The content for this section is included above in Section 3.1.

3.1.3. ACA Broadband Strategy & ATIC Role/Support

The content for this section is included above in Section 3.1.

3.2. Arizona Broadband Stakeholder Network (Steve Peters)

3.2.1. AZBSN Digital Access Task Force Updates

Steve Peters, Coordinator of the AZBSN Digital Access Task Force, reported that the Task Force continues to meet every Thursday morning at 8 am. EJ John will give a presentation on March 14 on the American Indian Policy Institute at ASU (https://aipi.asu.edu/) and what they are doing with respect to broadband activity. In addition to presentations at meetings, the AZBSN Task Force regularly receives briefings from the Arizona State Broadband Office, the State Library, Arizona Department of Education, and others involved in broadband and digital equity work in the state. Steve also





noted that he sends out a newsletter after every meeting that recaps the most recent meeting and conveys information about upcoming events, policy reports, and other relevant information, such as the meetings Maggie Farry spoke about, and links to recordings and transcripts of the weekly Task Force meetings.

Steve noted that he has decided to drop plans for an AZBSN study session to explain the Arizona BEAD challenge process. The State Broadband Office is doing a thorough job of explaining the state challenge process as discussed by Erin Lorandos in Section 3.1.

Steve said he would like to see an Arizona replacement for the Affordable Connectivity Program (ACP) which apparently is not going to be receiving extended Congressional funding and so will terminate at the end of April affecting many low-income households in Arizona. He has done some preliminary thinking about potential options including possible partnerships and funding opportunities. One option might be to expand the Arizona Universal Service Fund (AUSF) along the lines that Lea Marguez Peterson at the Arizona Corporation Commission (ACC) has described in the past; and the AUSF had been used to provide E-rate Modernization Program matching funds in the past. She opened an ACC docket on this and Steve suggested that we should find out if it is still open. A second option might involve the Local First Arizona Economic Recovery Center as a conduit for accessing available grants from foundations etc. as funding sources. The City of Tucson has been in contact with the Industrial Development Authority in Tucson for possible broadband-related funding, so this is a potential third option. A fourth option might be to extend already-built E-rate-funded networks at schools and libraries to serve their local communities. As Steve understands it, these networks can be extended if local governments or others (e.g. foundations) pay to extend them but there must be a costallocation process which schools/libraries may not be able to afford. The Sun Corridor Network, Final Mile Project, state government, local governments, foundations, schools and libraries could be part of an overall process to discuss such options for an Arizona ACP initiative. Steve will follow up with Maggie Farry about some of these options. He expressed the need to identify a lead entity going forward.

At the February ATIC Board meeting Steve described a number of recommendations he prepared on behalf of AZBSN that he submitted to the State Broadband Office on their Digital Equity Draft Plan.

1) There is a need for an entity like AZBSN to enable information sharing and collaboration. He also suggested that they reference the AZBSN Strategic Plan document published in November 2020.



- 2) Cybersecurity awareness mentioned in the plan is not sufficient. AZBSN has organized a team to develop a state cybersecurity strategy.
- 3) A digital inclusion sustainability strategy and ecosystem description is needed when the federal digital equity plan funding expires.
- 4) Local digital inclusion planning teams should be included. The Local First Arizona Economic Recovery Center could help communities do planning, find grants and manage grants.
- 5) Provide program development and community training for local community-based organizations.
- 6) Affordability of Internet service needs to go beyond ACP discussions. There should be discussion about leveraging E-rate, Sun Corridor Network, and the Final Mile Project to provide low-cost broadband infrastructure solutions. Steve is planning to arrange an AZBSN session to discuss this.

As noted in a previous meeting, Steve continues to work on organizing an AZBSN Cybersecurity and Cyber Safety team to provide recommendations for the state planning on this important topic. This team will be led by JT LaGrand, Jon Haass (Embry Riddle University), and Mala Muralidharan, and there are about a dozen participants on the team. Steve expects this team will convene meetings soon.

3.2.1.1. Updates to AZBSN Task Force Report

Steve said at a previous meeting that Karen Ziegler and John Kelly had been unable to get traction on the proposed project. So, there has been no progress on working on an update to the November 2020 AZBSN Digital Access Strategy Report and there is nothing new to report.

3.2.2. AZBSN Leadership Group & New Initiatives

Steve said at a previous meeting he will report on these topics after an updated plan has been issued.

Mark Goldstein urged Steve to initiate some action on re-constituting the AZBSN Leadership Team and involve some additional people to assist in making this happen so the full load is not carried only by Steve. Steve agreed.

3.2.3. Return to Outreach Activities with Newsletters & Webinars

No new action to report in this area.



3.3. Technology in Education/eLearning

3.3.1. Arizona Technology in Education Association (AzTEA) (Nan Williams)

Nan Williams serves as Executive Director of AzTEA (https://aztea.org/) and sits on the EDTechCommittee for the Arizona Department of Education (ADE) which is rewriting the Educational Technology standards this year. She is also participating in the ADE Technology Task Force on the Digital Learning Subcommittee and she is part of the ISTE policy group on digital equity access. She has also been working with the Arizona Rural Schools Association and their Final Mile Project (https://www.finalmileproject.com/).

Since AzTEA is now a Consortium for School Networking (CoSN, https://www.cosn.org/) affiliate, AzTEA is holding monthly chats with CIOs and CTOs of school districts to assist them in becoming certified educational technology leaders.

Nan was absent, but according to the AzTEA website there is a remote CI & IT Symposium scheduled for April 26. More details will be forthcoming.

3.3.2. Greater Arizona Educational Leadership (GAZEL) (Steve Peters)

The GAZEL Board hasn't met since early 2022 and needs reactivation and refreshing to further operationalize GAZEL. Steve has been in touch with existing Board members in an effort to revitalize the Board as a functional entity. The Board still needs to acquire Directors & Officers (D&O) insurance for good governance and proper protections especially if funded projects are to be undertaken.

Work to produce a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between GAZEL and ATIC on the AZBSN has been on hold and a determination should be made about whether this is still necessary and if so, how to accomplish it. Mark Goldstein stated that GAZEL needs to be reinvigorated including its interaction with ATIC on the AZBSN Digital Access Task Force. Steve stated he is looking into reactivating the GAZEL Board, and is talking to past GAZEL Board members to come up with a plan as well as engage new Board members.

3.3.3. Sun Corridor Network (SCN) (Laura Etter)

The SCN is Arizona's Research & Education Network supporting the state universities, education, healthcare, government and CAIs. Laura Etter's contact points are: Sun Corridor Network - https://suncorridor.org/ and





Laura@suncorridor.org.

Laura Etter was absent so there was no report but she gave a good update of SCN activities at the February ATIC Board meeting.

3.4. Arizona State Library (Holly Henley, Mala Muralidharan)

Holly Henley, the Director, Arizona State Library, reported in place of Mala Muralidharan who was absent that an offer has been made for a Digital Inclusion Library Consultant to succeed Erin Lorandos in that position. The name will be announced upon acceptance of the offer.

Holly reported that the E-rate Application process for FY 2024-25 will close on March 27, 2024, and on March 8, 2024, the Federal Communications Commission (FCC) announced that the E-rate program funding cap for FY2024 will be \$4.94 billion. This is a 3.6% inflation-adjusted increase from the FY2023 cap to keep pace with changing broadband needs of schools and libraries. E-rate has reimbursed \$85 million in Internet access costs for Arizona schools and libraries in the past year.

E-rate master contracts for Category 2 for the Mohave Educational Cooperative are now available and the Category 1 Internet Carrier State Master Contracts have been extended for 1 year by the State Procurement Office until June 30, 2025. Mala and Milan Eaton are available to assist in completing the E-rate application process.

The FCC announced that the Affordable Connectivity Program (ACP) will end at the end of April 2024. More than 520,000 households in Arizona that are enrolled in ACP will be affected. The Affordable Connectivity Program Extension Act (H.R. 6929) now has 191 co-sponsors.

Senator Ted Cruz through the US Senate Committee on Commerce, Science and Transportation put forward an 8-page blueprint for the Universal Service Fund (USF) called "Protecting Americans from Hidden FCC Tax Hikes". Henry Goldberg noted that he read an article that said his proposal would put Congress in control of the USF funding instead of the FCC. SHLB has issued a call for Senators to pay attention to the importance of the proposed USF reforms. Links to these discussions can be found in Mala's written report included below.

Holly also noted that there is an optimization tool for BEAD broadband funding developed by the Vernonburg Group, describing a methodology for estimating the cost of fiber broadband deployments taking account of different factors, and Sanborn Maps is doing a series of webinars on optimally utilizing the BEAD funds for the subgrantees. Additionally, the Toward Gigabit Libraries (TGL)



Toolkit has been designed for small rural, tribal, and urban libraries with limited information technology (IT) support. The TGL toolkit helps libraries understand and improve upon their IT environment and broadband services.

The Telehealth activities at the library are on hold for a short time awaiting the availability of Mala. Today Mala is giving an encore presentation (organized by the Southwest Telehealth Resource Center (https://southwesttrc.org/) on how to embed virtual care into the post-pandemic healthcare delivery system.

For more details, see the State Library Report below, submitted by Mala.

ATIC Board Meeting March 13, 2024, State Library Report

E-RATE:

- 1. E-rate Application process for FY 2024-5 will close on Wednesday, March 27, 2024, at 11:59 p.m. ET.
- 2. On March 8, 2024, the Federal Communications Commission announced that the E-rate program funding cap for FY2024 will be \$4.940 billion. This is a 3.6% inflation-adjusted increase from FY2023 cap of \$4.768 billion. The FCC began adjusting the funding cap in 2010 to ensure that the E-rate program funding keeps pace with the changing broadband needs for schools and libraries.
- Mohave Educational Cooperative Master contracts for Category 2 Mohave
 <u>Cooperative Arizona Cooperative Purchasing (mesc.org)</u> Click on New Contracts and all
 E-rate eligible contracts will be visible. Catergory 1 Internet Carrier State Master
 Contracts have been extended for 1 year by State Procurement Office till 2025 June 30
- 4. Milan and I will help all applicants through the process as needed. Contact us at Milan.eaton@azed.gov Mala@azlibrary.gov

E-rate reimburses nearly \$ 85 M in recurring internet costs for Schools and Libraries in Arizona Affordable Connectivity Program -ACP: On March 4, 2024, the Federal Communications Commission issued a Public Notice announcing that the last full month of benefit under the ACP will be April 2024 due to lack of additional funding from Congress. The ACP stopped accepting new applications and enrollments on February 7, 2024. Please refer to the FCC's website at fcc.gov/acp for more information.

Arizona has over 522,000 households who will be jeopardized.

The Affordable Connectivity Program Extension Act (H.R. 6929) now has 191 Cosponsors (House of Representatives)



National Telecommunications and Information Administration informed Congress that losing the ACP would undermine the historic \$42.5 billion the BEAD Program, for which the ACP supports a stable customer base to help incentivize deployment in rural areas. Additionally, ending ACP enrollments will also mean that the more than 240 outreach grant awardees across the country will need to wind down their grant-funded ACP outreach. Even worse is the fact that this will confuse the customers and undermine their confidence in the government and be a setback for the progress this program has made towards closing the digital divide.

Universal Service Funds Update: Senator Ted Cruz through the US Senate Committee on Commerce, Science and Transportation put forward an 8-page Blueprint for USF – Protecting Americans from hidden FCC tax hikes. universal-service-fund-blue-print-from-sen-ted-cruz.pdf-Google Drive Suggestions include:

- Avoid duplication between programs like Lifeline and the proposed Hot Spot lending
- Stop subsidizing legacy telephone companies
- Target low income groups who are not adopting internet yet

SHLB's call for Senators on the importance of USF reforms

https://www.shlb.org/uploads/Policy/National%20BB%20Plan/SHLB%20Responses%20to%20Senate%20USF%20Working%20Group%20RFC%20-%208.25.23.pdf
SHLB sponsored study <u>USForward: FCC Must Reform USF Contributions Now - An Analysis of the Options | SHLB Coalition</u>

USDA Rural Development recently announced its fifth round of funding for the ReConnect Program to connect millions of people in rural America to affordable high-speed internet. USDA is making several program improvements under Round 5. The application deadline has been extended to 5/21/24. For a full list of program improvements and program and application requirements, visit http://www.usda.gov/reconnect

BEAD implementation Optimization tools-

a. Vernonburg model: Very interesting model developed by Vernonburg Group, describing a methodology for estimating the cost of fiber broadband deployments, taking into account a multitude of factors including: the availability of existing infrastructure, cost of right-or-way and permits, terrain, the availability of skilled labor, the use of aerial versus buried fiber, and the accuracy of the infrastructure and broadband availability data. It is useful in the context of planning for BEAD implementation, developed and tested an approach to estimate the cost of delivering fiber broadband infrastructure to all BEAD-eligible unserved and underserved locations in the State of Vermont. The approach and results are described in

<u>Appendix+V Vernonburg+Group+Fiber+Costing+Model.pdf (squarespace.com)</u>
It can be useful in deciding what kind of technology or combination thereof will be most cost effective in utilizing the BEAD funding. This <u>Broadband Funding Optimization Tool</u>





was built around information for each state and built around the Initial Proposal Volume 1 documents e submitted by each state.

b. Sanborn Maps are doing a series of Webinars on optimally utilizing the BEAD funds for the subgrantees. All Webinars are archived at <u>Library Archives - Sanborn</u> In the coming months state broadband offices will evaluate the competing and overlapping geographies of proposed subgrantee project areas with respect to coverage, cost, competition, types of service, and more. Data scientists, broadband geospatial experts and broadband policy strategists explore strategies to combine available data resources – cost model data, Broadband Serviceable Locations (BSL), broadband coverage, demographics – and geographic methods to evaluate trade-offs among broadband project geographies.

Feb 21st webinar covered:

- Evaluating the Net Present Value (NPV) of proposed projects from the State's perspective
- Using geographic data to make the case for adjusting ("stretching", "bundling") proposed project areas to match your state's objectives and funding
- Applying an "equity lens" to evaluate using socio-economic data
- Ensuring that you are using the best cost and broadband data in your analysis and adjusting for discrepancies
- c. Toward Gigabit Libraries (TGL) Toolkit. This toolkit is designed for small, rural, Tribal, and urban libraries with limited information technology (IT) support. The Toward Gigabit Libraries (TGL) toolkit helps libraries understand and improve upon their IT environment and broadband services. This project was made possible in part by the Institute of Museum and Library Services (IMLS) through a Laura Bush 21st Century Librarian Program grant. The TGL toolkit is available for free online at https://internet2.edu/tgl TELEHEALTH: Regret not being able to attend today's ATIC meeting because I am doing an encore presentation From Novelty to Sustainability, How to Embed Virtual Care into the Post Pandemic Healthcare Delivery along with NLM and organized by the SW Telehealth Resource Center

End of Library Report





3.5. Telehealth (Mike Holcomb)

Mike Holcomb Interim Director of the Arizona Telemedicine Program (ATP, https://telemedicine.arizona.edu/) and newly elected to ATIC's Board, was absent so there was no report. Mike replaced Janet Major on the ATIC Board, with Janet's retirement from the University of Arizona.

3.6. Government Affairs

3.6.1. Arizona Broadband Policy Update (John Kelly, Mark Goldstein)

John Kelly was absent, and Mark reported on some recent government activity. Mark noted that John's firm provides ATIC officers and selected Board members with weekly reports on activities at the State Legislature.

The legislation to place broadband under ACC regulation is dead. Several Al related bills are still in play. There are some content filtering bills that raise some concerns. One of them would require devices to be pre-configured with content-blocking capabilities to prevent access to information that someone deems to be inappropriate. This bill is not likely to pass.

At the February meeting John reported that he had spoken to Representative Dunn, who chairs the rural caucus, and the ACA legislative liaison about ATIC's proposal to organize an informal broadband briefing for legislators, where Sandip Bhowmick would be the major presenter. They supported this proposal, so John agreed to work on arranging this, likely as a breakfast briefing, and some ATIC Board members will be invited to attend.

3.6.2. Federal Broadband Policy Update (Nicole Umayam/NTIA, Mark Goldstein)

Nicole Umayam is the Arizona Broadband Liaison Federal Program Officer (FPO), for the National Telecommunications and Information Administration (NTIA). As such she serves as the interface for the state of Arizona to the NTIA at the national level, supporting the State Broadband Office on the BEAD and Digital Equity Programs. Nicole has shared with NTIA key activities in Arizona such as those of the Arizona State Library and the ADE Final Mile Project.

Nicole was not present at today's meeting. Mark reported that the bipartisan and bicameral S. 341/H.R. 889, Broadband Grant Tax Treatment Act to make recent post-pandemic broadband grants, such as BEAD, non-taxable, still seems to be in play. It would amend the Internal Revenue Code to





ensure funding for broadband deployment from the Infrastructure Law including programs such as BEAD, the Middle Mile program, and the Tribal Broadband Connectivity Fund, and other similar federally funded broadband programs will not be considered taxable income. See https://insidetowers.com/telecom-industry-to-congress-spare-broadband-grants-from-taxes/. Mark noted that this is important to service providers in enabling investments in broadband infrastructure, and hopefully this will be resolved before ISPs bid on BEAD projects so they can take that into account and be more aggressive on their bids.

Henry Goldberg stated he read a recent article that more than 20 conservative groups urged Republican members of Congress to reject the NTIA requirement on states in their BEAD Initial Proposals to ensure that ISPs establish a low-priced option for low-income households to be eligible for BEAD grants. Mark added that Virginia and Florida and about four other states, object to inclusion of specific price points for a low-income option. Erin Lorandos stated that the Arizona State Broadband Office set \$50 as a low-price broadband requirement for low-income households in its Initial Proposal.

Steve said it is important to watch and track the USF discussions because it is the funding base for E-rate. Mark added that the USF has been funded by landline phone revenues which have been dropping precipitously, and there has been discussion of reforming USF funding to include other sources of telecommunications service provider and technology company funding to support E-rate, ACP, and other programs in the future.

Mark discussed two federal government broadband grant programs. He noted that the NTIA Tribal Broadband Connectivity Program (TBCP) Round 2 with its 60-day extension remains open, and this is a \$980 million final phase of this overall \$3 billion program. The \$700 million USDA ReConnect Round 5 grants and loans program is also open for an extended period until May 21. It is spread over four different categories: 100% loan, 50% loan and 50% grant, and two other grant categories.

4. Information and Action Plans

4.1. ATIC Website & Teleconferencing (All)

As noted previously by Mark and Steve, the ATIC website is aging a bit so this is an opportunity to clean it up and restructure it. The website is shared with AZBSN. Steve Peters had commented that there could be transcripts of ATIC Board meetings (as they do for AZBSN task force meetings) in combination with the recordings of the meetings and will discuss this with Oris and Mark.





Responding to Henry Goldberg's request to update the ATIC website at the October 11th Board Meeting, Kirk Busch reported that he updated the website to show John Kelly as the ATIC Lobbyist and added PJ Way to the Board members section. Kirk stated that he still has to add the bios that were previously on the website for many ATIC Board members as attached pdfs by now using links to an external webpage for improved security. Kirk will send an e-mail to these ATIC Board members to send him updated bios as either a pdf or a link to their LInkedin profile.

The website needs to be leveraged to publicize the Digital Access Task Force Report recommendations as well as using it for communications and public engagement, such as newsletters. Kirk noted that he will continue to promote ATIC/AZBSN on Linkedin and elsewhere.

4.1.1. AZBSN Communications & Newsletter

Mark at a previous meeting suggested that we should think about how to leverage some of the information sessions from the Monday morning AZBSN-COVID Digital Access Task Force meetings.

There remains a continuing need for volunteers to work

- (1) on regular maintenance of the Weebly ATIC website and
- (2) on providing a regular newsletter about all that's going on in the broadband world.

4.2. ATIC Mailing List & CRM (All)

Steve is discussing with Mark and Kirk Busch subscribing to a CRM/E-mail management service to meet the needs of the AZBSN Task Force.

4.3. New Business and Motion Considerations (All)

ATIC vs. AZBSN Roles and AZBSN Governance.

At a previous meeting Mark reminded everyone of the issue raised by Janet recently concerning AZBSN governance and oversight. Since Janet has retired this item has been removed from the minutes.

Also at a previous meeting Mark added that we did start to develop a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) in 2020 and the Executive Committee held several meetings on this topic. One of the decisions that was made was to let the finances of AZBSN operate under the management of GAZEL. However, the GAZEL Board has not met for some time and is not effectively acting in an operational capacity. Kirk Busch asked about the state of the draft MOU and



Mark said he would send him a copy.

5. Events Attended and Upcoming Meetings

Mark displayed the flyer for the upcoming "Arizona Broadband for All" event put on by the Arizona Regional Economic Development Foundation. Gigi Sohn and Drew Garner of the Benton Institute for Broadband and Society will speak at the event. The event will be held at the Flinn Foundation in downtown Phoenix on March 25. Sandip Bhowmick, Mark Goldstein, and Ilana Lowery will also be speaking at the event.

Steve mentioned that Gigi Sohn will also be on a panel to discuss local government networks at a meeting of the Broadband Breakfast, the link for which is https://broadbandbreakfast.com/. Steve added that this would be useful for a future AZBSN discussion topic on Municipal Networks pros and cons. Mark endorsed the Broadband Breakfast program which occurs weekly and is accessible online.

Oris will send a copy of this meeting's chat to Steve, Henry and Mark.

6. Announcements

7. Adjourn

At 1:15 pm



Upcoming ATIC Board Meetings

Upcoming ATIC Board Meetings for 2024 are scheduled for the second Wednesdays of the month (except August and December) from 12:00-2:00 p.m. and will be held fully virtually until further notice. Board Meetings are open for all to participate. Please plan to join us.

- April 10, 2024 from 12:00-2:00 pm
- May 8, 2024 from 12:00-2:00 pm
- June 12, 2024 from 12:00-2:00 pm
- July 10, 2024 from 12:00-2:00 pm
- No Board Meeting in August (Summer Break)
- September 11, 2024 from 12:00-2:00 pm
- October 9, 2024 from 12:00-2:00 pm
- November 13, 2024 from 12:00-2:00 pm
- No Board Meeting in December (Happy Holidays!)

ATIC Special and Public Meetings

AZBSN Digital Access Task Force continues to hold meetings every Thursday morning (except holidays) at 8:00 a.m. See the Planning page at https://www.arizonatele.org/covid19-planning.html for details.

Also see Task Force information and related resources at https://www.arizonatele.org/covid19-about.html.

Future AZBSN newsletter, webinars, and roundtables are under development.



Desert Financial Credit Union Arizona Telecommunications And Information ATIC 434041 *****04081-0400		Transaction Histor	
		Statement Period: All Dates	Date of Statement: 03/11/2024
Posted	Transactions (79)		
DATE	DESCRIPTION	AMOUNT	BALANCE
02/12/24	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$25.77	\$433.71
01/10/24	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$26.01	\$459.48
12/12/23	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$26.27	\$485.49
11/10/23	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$26.27	\$511.76
10/11/23	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$26.61	\$538,03
09/12/23	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$26.85	\$564,64
08/10/23	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$26,49	\$591.49
07/11/23	DRAFT #2226 TRACER 53197395	-\$933.00	\$617.98
07/11/23	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$26.37	\$1,550.98
06/27/23	ARIZONA TECHNOLOGY 8899 WWW.AZTECHCOU AZ IGOQJ9JX	-\$400.00	\$1,577.35
06/20/23	ONLINE BANKING TRANSFER FROM 0000	\$1,000.00	\$1,977.35
06/12/23	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$26.75	\$977.35
06/05/23	DRAFT #2225 TRACER 52470921	-\$10.00	\$1,004.10
05/19/23	DRAFT #2224 TRACER 52175931	-\$500.00	\$1,014.10
05/12/23	ONLINE BANKING TRANSFER FROM 0000	\$1,000.00	\$1,514,10
05/12/23	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$26.37	\$514.10
04/11/23	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$25.75	\$540.47
03/14/23	CENTURYLINK AUTO PAY AZ TELCOM INFO COUNCIL	-\$26.13	\$566.22



