ATIC Partnerships/Business Model/Strategy Working Group March 6, 2018, Teleconference Report

Attendees: Oris Friesen, Henry Goldberg, Mark Goldstein, Steve Peters, Karen Ziegler, Mike Whipple, Mala Muralidharan, Michael Cohen, Andy Phelan.

This is a report on the conference call held Tuesday, March 6, 2018, at 10 a.m. to follow up on the Partnerships/Business Model/Strategy Working Group.

1. Karen Zeigler reported on the status of the State Broadband Strategic Plan & FirstNet Deployment.

Karen said the "Arizona Statewide Broadband Strategic Plan" report has been accepted by state government leadership and is now public. Mark will distribute it with the ATIC agenda and minutes prior to next week's Board meeting. Participants in its development included Milan Eaton, Mala Muralidharan, Ken Dewitt, Mark Goldstein, Gale Lewis (ADOT), John Lucas, Janet Major, Marisa Walker (ACA), Keith Watkins (ACA), Michael Sherman, Karen and Bonnie Maney of Mission Critical Partners. The strategic plan is a good starting point for the reengagement of the State in broadband policy, as well as the creation of projects with tangible deliverables. The six defined goals to be met covered accessibility, governance & implementation, infrastructure, funding, education & outreach, and policy. The November concept paper proposed a new Broadband Office which was not included in the budget. But the Governor's staff met with Kirk Adams, Governor Doug Ducey's Chief of Staff, and they decided to identify this effort as a breakthrough project in the Goal Council 2 and assigned Sandra Watson, CEO of the Arizona Commerce Authority, as its executive sponsor, which is encouraging. The Strategic Plan team encouraged the Governor's Office to include important things done in the past as well, including recommendations from the DAC "Arizona's Strategic Plan for Digital Capacity" draft report of 2012. The Governor's Goal Council will convene a meeting shortly including representatives from ADOA, the State Land Department, the Department of Transportation, the Department of Public Safety, the ACA, and Department of Housing to discuss next steps. ASET has been kept aware of, but has not been directly participating in, the Strategic Plan activities. We will await a decision about creation of the Broadband Office and resourcing it, but it is not yet clear in which department such a Broadband Office would be housed.

Regarding FirstNet, the Version 2.0 Grant began on March 1st. AT&T is responsible now for user adoption, and the State will focus on governance, best practices, priorities, and integration efforts. The federal government agency coordinating FirstNet is called the FirstNet Authority under NTIA. Most of AT&T's 2018 buildout will be in the urban areas because rural areas require a lot of permitting and planning for future years. Band 14 capabilities will be rolled out soon. More information can be found at https://azfirstnet.az.gov/. AT&T is aware of the State Broadband Strategic Plan report and Karen will be discussing it with them.

2. Steve Peters discussed the proposed ATIC Broadband Stakeholder Network Meeting(s) to be held in early 2018. He has set up a proposed website in support of this activity at https://atic-networking.weebly.com/.

Steve stated that the purpose of the broadband stakeholder network meetings is to

ATIC Partnerships/Business Model/Strategy Working Group March 6, 2018, Teleconference Report

reengage people statewide who have not been involved with ATIC for some time. It is intended to create a mechanism to build a constituency for ATIC and educate them about what ATIC is doing. Steve proposed forming a leadership team for which we would seek to include Steve, Oris Friesen, Mark Goldstein, Henry Goldberg, Karen Ziegler, Milan Eaton, Mala Muralidharan, Marisa Walker, Michael Sherman, John Lucas, Janet Major, Jeff Sobotka, and Nan Williams. This team would be charged to get the stakeholder network process going.

Henry agreed that this is a good general direction but said we need to identify our role more concretely in enabling rural broadband deployment and by tying this broadband stakeholder network more directly into the recent state broadband strategic plan and the status of state E-rate modernization program applications. He suggested waiting for further discussions with Karen and Milan to identify our role more concretely. Steve said we wanted to form the leadership team to address such activities. Mark generally agreed with Steve saying we have ceased most of our external engagement activity and we need to get moving again as soon as possible to reengage the broader range of stakeholders. Oris agreed that ATIC should focus on concrete actions and said we should move forward to carry out both activities concurrently. Henry agreed but still felt that the website is much too general. Steve noted that we have limited resources so we just want to get started and go forward. Karen said we should not wait for the Governor's Goal Council to proceed on the Strategic Plan recommendations. Moreover it would be good to let the State government know, sooner than later, that ATIC can be a resource in moving ahead with the Strategic Plan. She added that education and outreach on broadband in rural areas is something ATIC could do with its contacts in the private sector and is something that the State will be unlikely to pursue on its own.

Oris concluded the discussion by suggesting that Steve proceed as planned, without waiting, to initiate the stakeholder network while ensuring that the process be openended enough to accommodate Henry's concerns, going forward. Henry added that he thinks the Broadband Stakeholder Network website should not be distributed in its current form, but wait for the meeting with the leadership team to discuss the mission of this activity

3. Mark reported on the status and future of the Arizona Broadband Map and the FCC National Broadband Map.

Mark noted that Arizona was one of six states to continue the broadband mapping effort after the 2010-2014 grant ended. After several years of inactivity, the FCC has refreshed its national broadband map The relaunched FCC National Broadband Map (https://broadbandmap.fcc.gov/#/) is as good or better than what we had for wireline (provider reported census block coverage) on the state portal and most welcome now that we've lost the AZGEO map collaboration with ASLD. The FCC data covers wireline, satellite and fixed wireless. They plan to add mobile wireless data soon. Some critique of the map is that the census data blocks only require one user site for the provider to claim that the entire census block area is covered, but this is as it has always been. Maybe AZGEO can incorporate the FCC data with our ancillary Community Anchor Institutions (CAIs) and their Arizona-specific demographic data

ATIC Partnerships/Business Model/Strategy Working Group March 6, 2018, Teleconference Report

and tools. This would be something for Karen to pursue. Mark stated maybe the FCC could be approached about incorporating CAI data into its map. Mark is comfortable with directing people to the FCC National Map for views of Arizona Broadband data by county, city, census block, etc.

ADOA has subscribed to CCMI's FiberLocator (https://www.fiberlocator.com/) giving them complementary fiber infrastructure data for internal strategic use along with whatever provider submitted info they are able to gather. Mark commented that this service provides very good metro fiber deployment data including on net buildings useful for real estate and selective rural fiber data of varying comprehensiveness and completeness. Karen plans to meet with ASLD and they are amenable to doing upgrades to their map assuming funding is available. Mark noted that the FiberLocator licensing restrictions are quite restrictive but said this is a good complementary source given the problems with service providers providing their fiber deployment data to the State.

4. Steve reported on progress and proposed timeframe for the GAZeL-ATIC-AzTEA proposed Labster (https://www.labster.com/) virtual online labs project for Arizona educational institutions and rural demonstration project. He has constructed a working website for this project at https://gazel-labster.weebly.com/.

Steve noted that Angie Odom, Labster's representative in Arizona, is no longer with Labster so he has reconnected with Maaroof Fakhri. The objective of the project is to create a consortium to provide Labster virtual online labs for free or at low cost to Arizona schools, community colleges, and universities. The project will obtain input from schools as to which Labster virtual labs would be of interest to them. Maaroof will visit ASU for a demo in early April so maybe team members can meet with him then.

5. A new agenda item was added by Steve dealing with the Community Reinvestment Act, and an organization called GenYES (see https://www.genyes.org/).

Steve spoke recently with Dennis Harper the CEO of GenYES. He is involved with the Community Reinvestment Act (CRA) to introduce low-cost information technology support to schools to help overcome the existing digital divide. The CRA is a federal law encouraging banks to meet the needs of low and moderate income communities. It may be used to encourage banks to provide loans and grants for broadband infrastructure and information technology to overcome the digital divide. See https://www.dallasfed.org/assets/documents/cd/pubs/digitaldivide.pdf. The problem is that few schools know about CRA and most banks are not yet involved with CRA for broadband purposes. Harper will be in Arizona on March 24th and could discuss with us how to use CRA for broadband in rural areas. Steve will try to set up a meeting with Harper on March 26th. Mark added he has a direct relationship with the Arizona Bankers Association (https://azbankers.org/) through his tracking of the Arizona fintech ecosystem, so maybe we can tie them into this.